

OREA

Offices of Research and Education Accountability

TENNESSEE COMPTROLLER OF THE TREASURY, JUSTIN P. WILSON

Supplemental Educational Services in Tennessee

Prepared for the Senate Education Committee

Chairman Dolores Gresham

by the Comptroller's Offices of Research and Education
Accountability

February 2010

Definition

Supplemental Educational Services (SES)

Under No Child Left Behind, additional academic assistance—one-on-one or small group tutoring—in math and reading offered to students in Title I schools that have not made AYP for three years.

SES stakeholders and their responsibilities

State Education Agencies (for example, TDOE)

- Approve providers
- Monitor the quality and effectiveness of providers
- Monitor LEA implementation of SES

Local Education Agencies (LEAs)

- Provide notice at least annually to parents about SES
- Help parents choose a provider, if requested
- Enter into agreements with providers that parents select
- Terminate a provider's provision of SES to an individual student if terms of agreement are not being met
- Meet its 20 percent funding obligation

SES Providers

- Work with LEAs and parents to develop agreements for appropriate services for individual students
- Provide services in accordance with district agreements
- Provide parents and LEAs information on tutored students' progress

Parents of eligible students

- Choose a provider from the state-approved list
- Work with the LEA and provider to develop agreements for appropriate services for their child
- Ensure that their child attends scheduled SES sessions regularly

How is SES funded?

- Parents of eligible students pay nothing.
- An LEA that is required to provide SES must set aside an amount equal to 20 percent of its Title I, Part A allocations from the USDOE to pay for:
 - choice-related transportation (transportation provided for students in schools identified for improvement whose parents have elected to enroll them in another school);
 - SES; or
 - a combination of choice-related transportation and SES.

How is SES funded? (cont.)

- In other words: What an LEA must expend on SES depends on how much it spends first on choice-related transportation, which, in turn, depends on parental demand. (Parental demand for both choice and SES is low in Tennessee and nationally—see next section.)
- TDOE posts on its website this information by LEA:
 - the 20 percent set-aside available for choice-related transportation and SES and
 - the per pupil amount available for SES.

These vary among LEAs and determine, based on providers' hourly rates, the number of tutoring sessions that can be provided for eligible students.

How much parental demand has there been for SES?

- Parental demand for Public School Choice and SES is low in Tennessee and nationally.
- In Tennessee, in school year 2007-08:

Number of Students	Choice	SES
Eligible for service	63,894	35,809
Applied for service	3,398 (5.32%)	4,539 (12.67%)
Received service	2,857 (4.47%)	3,671 (10.25%)

- Nationally, in 2005-06 (the year for which the most recent national data is available), about 1 percent of eligible students participated in school choice and about 17 percent participated in SES.

Has SES made a difference in student achievement?

The Center for Research in Educational Policy (CREP) at the University of Memphis evaluates Tennessee's SES program annually.

2003-04 and 2004-05 results:

No providers showed statistically significant effects.

2005-06 results:

The effects of tutoring on student achievement tended to be small and, with only a few exceptions, not significantly different from zero.

2007-08 results:

In math, three providers were significantly worse than the control group; no providers were significantly better than the control group; in reading/language arts, no providers were significantly better or worse than the control students in both models.

2008-09 results (unpublished - results shared with TDOE in mid-February 2010):

All providers lacked sufficient data to make a determination of effectiveness

SES provider information

Provider	Session Information	Description of Services	Available to Serve
<p>Cell #1 shows the provider's effectiveness in raising student achievement in reading/language arts and/or math based on an evaluation of the provider's services.</p> <p>Cell #1 - Student Achievement <i>Reading/Language Arts</i> <i>Insufficient data</i> <i>Math</i> <i>Below Standards</i></p>	<p>Tutoring session information and the amount per hour the provider charges the school district for your child's tutoring.</p> <p>Cell #2 - Customer Satisfaction <i>Communication</i> ★★ <i>Instructional Plan</i> ★★ <i>Local & State Standards</i> ★★★ <i>Special Ed. and ELL Students</i> ★ <i>Assessment of Provider Overall</i> ★★</p>	<p>Tutoring service information including the subjects, group size, and tutor qualifications.</p> <p>Cell #3 The provider says this about its services:</p>	<p>The school districts that the provider will serve and tutoring site locations.</p> <p>Cell #3 provides a statement that the provider makes about its services.</p>
<p>★★★ Above Standards ★★ Acceptable ★ Marginal Quality No Stars=Below Standards</p>			

For a full listing of 2009-10 SES providers, see http://www.state.tn.us/education/fedprog/doc/SES_Prov_List_12_09.pdf

Has SES made a difference in student achievement? (cont.)

The CREP study authors suggest that gains in student achievement as a result of SES may not be a reasonable expectation:

Even if the SES tutoring were highly adaptive to student needs...30–40 total [hours] of one-on-one tutoring may have, at best, only limited potential to raise student achievement on standardized tests. Obviously, there are so many factors, such as teacher effectiveness, school leadership, and interventions, such as comprehensive school reform, extended-day, reduced class size, or special reading and math programs that potentially exert much stronger effects on student learning or (minimally) serve as confounding variables that mask tutoring effects.

Has SES made a difference in student achievement? (cont.)

However, they also note that

SES may well have important positive impacts on students that extend beyond achievement gains on state assessments. Such benefits might include increased motivation, self-efficacy, metacognitive skills, and development of effective learning habits.

Additional points

- Tennessee received a one-year waiver from USDOE that will allow High Priority LEAs and High Priority Title I schools to act as providers during the 2010-11 school year. (An LEA wishing to do this must complete the same TDOE application process as any other provider.)
- NCLB's forthcoming reauthorization may alter the SES program or end it altogether.

Contact Information

Comptroller's Offices of Research and
Education Accountability (OREA)

Phillip Doss, Director

Russell Moore, Assistant Director

Telephone - (615) 401-7866

<http://www.comptroller1.state.tn.us/OREA/>